



City of Portland MLK Memorial Selection Committee

Room 209
5:30 PM - 7:30 PM

1. Review and Approve Minutes - 5:30 PM
 - a. Phase 2 Acceptance & Non-acceptance Letters
 - b. Draft Minutes
2. Committee Status Conversation
3. Phase 2 Finalists Presentation - 6:00 PM
 - a. Robert Katz Team
 - b. TJD&A Landscape Architect Team (withdrew on January 29, 2020)
 - a. Robert Katz Team Presentation
 - b. TJD&A Landscape Architect Team Withdrawal Letter
4. Questions from Committee
5. Public Comment
6. Deliberation
 - a. Finalists Scoring Rubric
7. Next Meeting
8. Adjournment



City of Portland
Martin Luther King Memorial Selection Committee

November 26, 2019

Subject: Martin Luther King Memorial on the Bayside Trail - Outcome of Finalists Presentations

To the Robert Katz Design Team --

Thank you for presenting your design proposal to the MLK Memorial Selection Committee and the public on November 14, 2019. On behalf of the Committee, we appreciate all your hard work. The Committee met on Tuesday, November 19 to review the proposals and deliberate. Each Committee member discussed their pros and cons of each proposal. The Committee's Creative Consultants, Marcia and Daniel Minter of Indigo Arts Alliance, provided the Committee with feedback related to creative and cultural research, national and international relevance of MLK Memorials, project scope and requirements, and feedback on each design.

After several hours of discussion, the Committee decided to move forward with two teams to participate in a second design phase. We are pleased to inform you that your team has been chosen to participate in this continued process along with the TJD&A Landscape Architect team. In phase two, you will be asked to revise your design proposal based on the Committee's feedback and then present a second version to the Committee in February. Your group will be entitled to a stipend of \$1,250 for this second round.

As you revise your proposal, we recommend you consider the following feedback:

- The Committee enjoyed the concept of the welcoming table, but felt the ziggurat structure missed the mark
- Consider pairing down the number of design elements included and work on staying closer to the original budgetary guidelines
- Consider a focal element that artistically has the power to command attention and reflects the hope Dr. King had for his people and our society as a whole. It should have both emotional resonance and power.
- Contemplate what new information one can learn about Martin Luther King from the memorial art/space, or deeper understanding of him and his values it conveys, and how the design stands out from other memorials
- Consider reflecting further on the history of the African American and black communities, and social justice efforts, in Maine and Portland.

The Committee will be looking to see how well the two teams incorporate the feedback into their revised designs. Should you wish, you are welcome to reach out and consult with the Committee's Creative Consultants, Marcia and Daniel Minter, in order to further develop your proposals. They may be reached via email at d1minter@gmail.com and/or marciaminter@gmail.com.

It is the hope of the Committee to be able to move forward with the selection of a design team

following this second phase. However, as we're sure you're aware, there is a chance that the revised proposals may not be accepted. We will be in touch very soon with the date in February in which you'll present your redesign.

If you have any questions or concerns please address them to Jessica Grondin, staff to the Committee, at jgrondin@portlandmaine.gov.

We sincerely thank you, again, for participating in this process.

Sincerely,

Jill Duson
MLK Memorial Committee Co-Chair

Rev. Kenneth I. Lewis
MLK Memorial Committee Co-Chair

cc:
Selection Committee



**City of Portland
Martin Luther King Memorial Selection Committee**

November 26, 2019

Subject: Martin Luther King Memorial on the Bayside Trail - Outcome of Finalists Presentations

To the TJD&A Design Team --

Thank you for presenting your design proposal to the MLK Memorial Selection Committee and the public on November 14, 2019. On behalf of the Committee, we appreciate all your hard work. The Committee met on Tuesday, November 19 to review the proposals and deliberate. Each Committee member discussed their pros and cons of each proposal. The Committee's Creative Consultants, Marcia and Daniel Minter of Indigo Arts Alliance, provided the Committee with feedback related to creative and cultural research, national and international relevance of MLK Memorials, project scope and requirements, and feedback on each design.

After several hours of discussion, the Committee decided to move forward with two teams to participate in a second design phase. We are pleased to inform you that your team has been chosen to participate in this continued process along with the Robert Katz team. In phase two, you will be asked to revise your design proposal based on the Committee's feedback and then present a second version to the Committee in February. Your group will be entitled to a stipend of \$1,250 for this second round.

As you revise your proposal, we recommend you consider the following feedback:

- The Committee appreciated your community engagement efforts, and the blank canvas to work from, but wondered how one might know they are at a MLK Memorial
- Consider refining the artwork/sculpture examples provided in the RFQ, but left out of the RFP design
- Consider pairing down the number of design elements included and work on staying closer to the original budgetary guidelines
- Contemplate further if the neon signs are an appropriate reflection of MLK or too gimmicky
- Consider how the audio technology might be applicable in the future
- Consider a focal element that artistically has the power to command attention and reflects the hope Dr. King had for his people and our society as a whole. It should have both emotional resonance and power.
- Contemplate what new information one can learn about Martin Luther King from the memorial art/space, or deeper understanding of him and his values it conveys, and how the design stands out from other memorials
- Consider reflecting further on the history of the African American and black communities, and social justice efforts, in Maine and Portland.

The Committee will be looking to see how well the two teams incorporate the feedback into their revised designs. Should you wish, you are welcome to reach out and consult with the Committee's Creative Consultants, Marcia and Daniel Minter, in order to further develop your proposals. They may be reached via email at dlminter@gmail.com and/or marciaminter@gmail.com.

It is the hope of the Committee to be able to move forward with the selection of a design team following this second phase. However, as we're sure you're aware, there is a chance that the revised proposals may not be accepted. We will be in touch very soon with the date in February in which you'll present your redesign.

If you have any questions or concerns please address them to Jessica Grondin, staff to the Committee, at jgrondin@portlandmaine.gov.

We sincerely thank you, again, for participating in this process.

Sincerely,

Jill Duson
MLK Memorial Committee Co-Chair

Rev. Kenneth I. Lewis
MLK Memorial Committee Co-Chair

cc:
Selection Committee



**City of Portland
Martin Luther King Memorial Selection Committee**

November 26, 2019

**Subject: Martin Luther King Memorial on the Bayside Trail - Outcome of Finalists
Presentations**

To the Ironwood Landscape Architect Team --

Thank you for presenting your design proposal to the MLK Memorial Selection Committee and the public on November 14, 2019. On behalf of the Committee, we appreciate all your hard work. The Committee met on Tuesday, November 19 to review the proposals and deliberate. Each Committee member discussed their pros and cons of each proposal. The Committee's Creative Consultants, Marcia and Daniel Minter of Indigo Arts Alliance, provided the Committee with feedback related to creative and cultural research, national and international relevance of MLK Memorials, project scope and requirements, and feedback on each design.

After several hours of discussion, the Committee decided to move forward with two teams to participate in a second design phase. We regret to inform you that your team has not been chosen to participate in this continued process.

We sincerely thank you, again, for your participation.

Sincerely,

Jill Duson
MLK Memorial Committee Co-Chair

Rev. Kenneth I. Lewis
MLK Memorial Committee Co-Chair

cc:
Selection Committee

MLK Memorial Selection Committee Meeting
November 19, 2019 at 5:00 PM
Room 24, City Hall

Committee Members in attendance:

Councilor Jill Duson, Reverend Kenneth Lewis, Christina Richardson, Cyrus Hagge, Lin Lisberger, Ethan Hipple, Kara Wooldrik.

Creative Consultants: Marcia Minter, Daniel Minter.

Staff: Jessica Grondin

1. Process Discussion

- Process for deliberation and evaluation
- Talk about what you generally liked/disliked, what struck you before talking about scores
- Make sure project requirements are remembered when discussing reactions

2. Discussion of finalists presentations

- Each Committee member gave pros and cons of each design (see attached notes)
- Creative consultants gave feedback related to creative and cultural research, national and international relevance, scope, project requirements, and feedback on each design.
- Timeline may not have been long enough to fully develop proposals
- With many underwhelmed by the designs, and no clear favorite, Councilor Duson asks where do we go from here and what are the next steps. Committee discusses either picking one and working with them or re-opening the bids.
- Should we ask them to come back with just \$100,000 proposals? Something smaller and not as spread out.
- Suggestion to pick one firm to work with and have them go back and do further cultural research and ask them to come up with something within budget.
- How does one identify which one has the inspiration to move forward with the process?
- There is a fear that if we don't move the process forward and choose someone to work with further that this project will linger again for years, and there is the impetus to see it to fruition after previously failed attempts.
- RFP attracted landscape architects more than public artists. Should we choose a team to work on the landscape design and then fundraise for a piece of public art to situate in the new space?
- Should one team be chosen with some general feedback on the pros and cons from the Committee and ask the team to come up with a revised plan? This would not mean chipping away at the proposal or saying take this out, put this in, just rather general feedback on what concepts were favored.

- Creative consultants said choosing a team and providing feedback for a revised plan is normal practice and something that is not out of the ordinary.
- Other suggestion of not choosing any team since the basic understanding of MLK was very surface like and not very deep. Nothing new regarding him.
- Not sure any of the finalists could revise their plans adequately on their own, they would need help.
- Is there the capacity or ability for our creative consultants to assist a chosen team on revising their proposal?

Christina -- voted for Katz with revisions

Rev Lewis -- can't vote for any of them

Cyrus -- TJD&A with revisions -- explained there are artwork/sculpture examples in the RFQ proposal but were left out of RFP proposal

Lin -- Katz but with revisions

Ethan -- Ironwood but with revisions

Kara -- TJD&A with revisions

Jill -- Katz with revisions

- We are at a point of working with TDJ&A and Katz -- eliminated Ironwood -- to move forward with revisions on another stage. Need to finalize additional \$ to give them for additional round.
- Jessica will list out 3 top pieces of feedback from tonight's meeting and share it with them to assist them in their revisions without telling them what to do.

What's the timeline for this next stage?

- Message to applicants need to go out by early December
- Tell 2 finalists they are moving forward to next round, provide key feedback to them, and then let them know when the next interview would be. Push off next interview to early February. Get them the letter by early December.
- Hope to make a decision in February.
- Need to pick a February date.
- Communicate with Committee via email between now and then.

Adjournment: 7:55 PM. Motion made by Cyrus and seconded by Christina.



Landscape Architects & Planners

January 29, 2019

Jessica Grondin
Director of Communications & Digital Services
City of Portland
389 Congress Street
Portland, Maine 04101

RE: DR. MARTIN LUTHER KING MEMORIAL

Dear Jessica,

Thank you for the invitation to the second round of design for the memorial to Dr. Martin Luther King along the Bayside Trail in Portland. However, our team of TJD&A and Evan Haynes must withdraw from the competition and will not be able to participate in the February 6 presentation. Evan recently had an injury that left him with limited mobility and unable to continue with the design process.

We regret not being in a position to continue to explore the opportunities inherent in this memorial. We trust that the City will move forward with a design that is both a fitting expression of our collective admiration for Dr. King and a statement about the role that public art plays in the life of the community.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Terry DeWan', with a stylized, flowing script.

Terry DeWan
TJD&A Landscape Architects
Yarmouth, Maine

A handwritten signature in dark ink, appearing to read 'Evan Haynes', with a stylized, flowing script.

Evan Haynes
Sculptor
South Freeport, Maine

MLK Memorial Finalists Artist Selection – Artist Rubric

MLK Memorial Selection Committee Finalist Scoring Rubric Applicants will be scored on a scale of 1 to 5 points for each category.	<u>Definition of Point Scale:</u> 1 - Does not meet minimum standards 3 - Meets minimum standards 5 - Exceeds minimum standards
--	---

Finalists		Ironwood Design Group	Robert Katz	TDJ&A Landscape Architects		Comments
Design appropriate for space						
Design commands the space						
Design enhances Portland's reputation as a city which celebrates the arts						
Design highlights commitment to social justice, resilience, and racial equity						

Finalists		Ironwood Design Group	Robert Katz	TDJ&A Landscape Architects		Comments
Design inspire visitors to reflect on Dr. King's life and the values he espoused						
Programmatic element: Does the proposal invite educational opportunities & community engagement						
Visibility: 1. Transitioning through the space 2. Day/night 3. seasonal						
Durability and maintenance of the design						
Did the finalist seek out or incorporate any community engagement in the final design?						