



City of Portland City Manager Search Subcommittee Meeting

Thursday, June 9, 2022 at 8:00 AM Via Zoom

To submit written public comment on an agenda item, email publiccomment@portlandmaine.gov. Submissions must be received by 12:00 pm the day before the City Manager Search Subcommittee meeting to guarantee their inclusion in the agenda packet. All submissions must include the commenter's name and legal address. To help ensure your comment is submitted for the correct item, please include the name of the agenda item (see below).

REMOTE ACCESS INFORMATION:

The City Manager Search Subcommittee will conduct this meeting remotely via Zoom pursuant to the Remote Meeting Policy adopted by the Portland City Council. Allow your computer to install the free Zoom app to get the best meeting experience. If you are not able to attend live either in person or via Zoom, a recording will be available in the [Agenda Center](#) following the meeting.

For public comment via Zoom, you will need to use the "raise your hand" feature. To raise your hand via the telephone, please hit *9. You will be unmuted by the host when it is time for public comment.

Please click the link below to join the webinar:

<https://portlandmaine-gov.zoom.us/j/85809476864?pwd=ZGxNM0U1VnpJVDJyUSs1NGJxSkNmQT09>

Passcode: 255462

Or One tap mobile :

US: +13126266799,,85809476864#,,,,*255462# or +19292056099,,85809476864#,,,,*255462#

Or Telephone:

Dial(for higher quality, dial a number based on your current location):

US: +1 312 626 6799 or +1 929 205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782

Webinar ID: 858 0947 6864

Passcode: 255462

1. Call to order
2. Approve Minutes of May 19th, May 26th and June 2nd meetings
 - a. May 19th meeting minutes
 - b. May 26th meeting minutes
 - c. June 2nd meeting minutes
3. Review and discuss mini proposals for selection of City Manager search firm
 - a. GovHR Proposal
 - b. Baker Tilly Proposal

City of Portland

Via Zoom

- c. RFP Additional Scoresheet
- 4. New Business (5 minutes)
- 5. Determine and set Next Meeting Date
- 6. Adjournment

City Manager Search Subcommittee Minutes
May 19, 2022

The May 19, 2022 City Manager Search Subcommittee meeting was called to order by Subcommittee Chair, Mayor Kate Snyder at 8:04 AM on Zoom.

Mayor Kate Snyder (Chair), Councilor Mark Dion, Councilor Pious Ali, Tom Caiazzo (Deputy Human Resources Director), Samantha Chapin (Purchasing Manager) and Jessica Grondin (Communications Director) were present.

The Mayor opened the meeting with introductions and went through the agenda and how the meeting will proceed.

The minutes from the April 21 2022 and April 28, 2022 meetings were unanimously approved.

The Mayor asked if there was any public comment on the committee's motion to go into executive session. There was no public comment.

The subcommittee unanimously voted to go into executive session pursuant to 1 M.R.S. Section 405(6)(A) to discuss the applications for the City Clerk position.

The subcommittee left the ZOOM meeting to go into executive session.

The subcommittee came out of executive session at 8:31 AM to resume the regular City Manager Search Subcommittee meeting.

The Mayor explained where the committee was at concerning the City Clerk position. Tom Caiazzo explained how the interview questions were compiled and there was a recommendation to update the questions for interviewing candidates for the City Clerk position.

A discussion took place as to when and if we need to publish the interview questions. Councilors felt that it could be an unfair advantage for the candidates to have access to the questions before their interviews. Corporation Counsel will be consulted regarding if the interview questions can remain private until the interviews are conducted. The committee will review the questions and get final edits to Tom Caiazzo by the beginning of next week. The committee wants to move quickly to get interviews scheduled. Tom Caiazzo will contact the candidates to try to schedule interviews for May 26th or May 27th.

The subcommittee moved on to discuss the City Manager search firm selection. Samantha Chapin gave a brief update of what has been communicated to the two firms remaining in the selection process.

Mayor Snyder moved on to setting up the next meeting dates. One meeting will be scheduled to hold interviews and another meeting will be scheduled to hold the regular meeting of the committee.

The subcommittee set the next regular meeting for June 9, 2022.

Motion made to adjourn by Councilor Dion and seconded by Councilor Ali. The motion passed unanimously. Meeting was adjourned by Chair Snyder at 8:53 AM.

City Manager Search Subcommittee Minutes
May 26, 2022

The May 26, 2022 City Manager Search Subcommittee meeting was called to order by Subcommittee Chair, Mayor Kate Snyder at 8:00 AM on Zoom.

Mayor Kate Snyder (Chair), Councilor Mark Dion, Councilor April Fournier, Tom Caiazzo (Deputy Human Resources Director), and Jessica Grondin (Communications Director) were present.

The Mayor opened the meeting with introductions and went through the agenda and how the meeting will proceed. The Mayor explained that the committee will be voting themselves into executive session to conduct interviews with the candidates for the Council appointed City Clerk position.

The Mayor asked for a motion to go into executive session pursuant to 1 M.R.S. Section 405(6)(A) to interview the applicants for the City Clerk position.

The committee unanimously voted to go into executive session pursuant to 1 M.R.S. Section 405(6)(A). The committee members left the ZOOM meeting to conduct interviews.

The committee returned to the ZOOM meeting at 10:02 AM. A motion was made and the committee unanimously voted to come out of executive session.

The Mayor recapped where we are at with selecting a new City Clerk and the process to complete that hire.

Motion made to adjourn by Councilor Dion and seconded by Councilor Fournier. The motion passed unanimously. Meeting was adjourned by Chair Snyder at 10:06 AM.

City Manager Search Subcommittee Minutes
June 2, 2022

The June 2, 2022 City Manager Search Subcommittee meeting was called to order by Subcommittee Chair, Mayor Kate Snyder at 8:04 AM on Zoom.

Mayor Kate Snyder (Chair), Councilor Mark Dion, Councilor April Fournier, Councilor Ali, Tom Caiazzo (Deputy Human Resources Director), and Jessica Grondin (Communications Director) were present.

The Mayor opened the meeting with introductions and went through the agenda. The meeting should be brief. The Mayor explained that she and Anne Torregrossa met with the candidate for the City Clerk position and there was interest from the candidate. The committee will be voting to make a recommendation to the full Council. Councilor Ali joined the meeting.

The Mayor explained that at the upcoming Council meeting on June 6th there will hopefully be two actions for the Council to consider:

1. Naming an acting City Clerk for the period from when the current City Clerk retires (June 17th) until the new City Clerk is appointed and
2. A recommendation from this committee to appoint a new clerk permanently.

The recommended candidate's cover letter and resume are attached to this agenda as back up material.

A motion was made to recommend Ashley Rand to be appointed as the next City of Portland City Clerk.

Motion was made by Councilor Fournier and seconded by Councilor Ali. There were no public attendees so public comment was opened and closed without comment. The motion was unanimously passed.

The next regular meeting of the search subcommittee will be held on Thursday, June 9, 2022.

Motion made to adjourn by Councilor Ali and seconded by Councilor Fournier. The motion passed unanimously. Meeting was adjourned by Chair Snyder at 8:11 AM.

CITY OF PORTLAND, MAINE CITY MANAGER

Recruitment Phase I Detail May 31, 2022



630 Dundee Road

Suite 225

Northbrook, IL 60062

Primary Contact Person: Laurie Pederson

Director of Administrative Services

847-380-3240

info@GovHRusa.com

A note about COVID-19 -- We are carefully monitoring recommendations from the federal, state and local governments and working with clients as they begin to reopen. Before COVID we made extensive use of technology for video interviews with candidates and meetings with clients. We have utilized these during COVID and can combine technology with appropriate in person meetings to assist clients in cost effective recruiting.

Phase I: Position Assessment, Position Announcement & Brochure

June 2022 until election in November 2022:

GovHR treats each executive recruitment as a transparent partnership with our client. We believe in engaging with stakeholders early in each recruitment process to fully understand the challenges and opportunities inherent in the position. Understanding the organizational culture is critical to a successful recruitment. We gain this insight and information through meetings (one on one and small groups), surveys and a review of relevant information. This information is reflected in a polished marketing piece that showcases the organization and the area it serves.

A combination of these items can be used to fully understand the organization, the community, and the position.

Information Gathering:

- GovHR will conduct one-on-one or group interviews with stakeholders and department heads that are identified by the client (up to 12 hours). Additional meetings optional.
- GovHR can establish a dedicated email address for feedback from stakeholders or the community.
- Community forum (In-person or via video) can be used to gather input and feedback.
- Surveys can be used for Organization personnel.
- Surveys can be used for Community feedback.

Examples of Successful Community Outreach Processes

#1 GovHR completed the City Manager recruitment for the City of Evanston, Illinois in 2020. The search process included the following community outreach processes:

- Several zoom based public feedback sessions prior to the start of the recruitment.
- Distributed a community survey for feedback prior to the start of the recruitment.
- Community panels interviewed finalist candidates.
- Finalist candidates participated in webinar answering questions developed from community members' suggestions.
- Candidates were apprised of each step in the process and provided with detailed information on how each meeting would be conducted.

#2 GovHR completed the City Manager recruitment for the City of Lakeland, Florida in 2020:

- Candidates participated in an in person public forum where the public could meet the candidates informally and then participate in a more formal question and answer session. Comment cards were provided so the public could provide their feedback on each of the candidates. This same public forum process has been used in Beloit WI (City Manager); Oberlin, OH (City Manager) Cambridge, MA (City Manager); Ferguson MO (City Manager) and in many other communities.
- Candidates were advised at the time of application that their materials are subject to public disclosure. Candidates were also advised of the public forum process and given several days'

advance notice of the opportunity to give an overview of their credentials at the start of the forum.

#3 GovHR completed the Williamstown, Massachusetts Town Manager recruitment in 2021:

- The Town used a 12-person search committee with 2 members of the Select Board as co-chairs, that guided, among other things, the public outreach process, seeking input on experience, management style and issues needing the new Town Manager’s attention. Input for the position profile included a community-wide survey which was available online, and was also distributed at farmers markets and other neighborhood gatherings. At those events, the highly involved search committee members brought paper copies of the survey and then entered the results on the respondents’ behalf online for the search committee’s review.

We have many other examples of successful community outreach efforts. We are happy to use a combination of these practices in Portland’s City Manager search process.

Project Timeline

June 2022 thru November	Week 1	Week 2	Week 3	Week 4	Week 5	Week 6	Week 7	Week 8	Week 9	Week 10	Week 11	Week 12
Phase I	Phase II				Phase III			Phase IV	Phase V		Phase VI	

June thru November	Phase 1: Stakeholder Interviews & Brochure Development
November 2022 Weeks 1 thru 4	Phase 2: Advertising, Candidate Recruitment & Outreach
Weeks 5 thru 7	Phase 3: Candidate Evaluation & Background Screening
Week 8	Phase 4: Presentation of Recommended Candidates
Week 9 & 10	Phase 5: Interview Process & Additional Background Screening
Weeks 11 & 12	Phase 6: Appointment of Candidate



PRESENTED TO THE CITY OF PORTLAND, MAINE

ADDITIONAL INFORMATION REQUEST

IN RESPONSE TO **RFP #22037**

EXECUTIVE RECRUITMENT SERVICES

FOR THE POSITION OF

CITY MANAGER

June 2, 2022



2500 Dallas Parkway, Suite 300 • Plano, Texas • 972-748-0300 • www.bakertilly.com

CITY OF PORTLAND, MAINE
CITY MANAGER EXECUTIVE RECRUITMENT | SEPARATED INTO PHASES
Proposed Timeline as of June 2, 2022

The following Timeline represents a preliminary schedule to conduct an “Initial Executive Search Preparatory Phase” (Phase I), extending from **June through October 2022**, to be followed by a series of “Executive Search Implementation Phases” (Phases 2-5), extending from **November 2022 until completion of the recruitment in Spring 2023**.

Please Note: Commencement of Phase I, and the additional phases as a group, are contingent upon the approval of two (2) separate agreements by the City and Baker Tilly – Phase I agreement to be finalized in June of 2022; and, the agreement for Phases II, III, IV, & Conclusion to be finalized in November/December of 2022. Actual target dates will be developed in consultation with and approved by the City.

PHASE I – INITIAL SEARCH PREPARATION

Project Milestone	Deliverables	Target Date
<u>Phase I</u> Profile/Brochure Development and Ad Preparation.	- Consultant works with City to schedule and conduct on-site meetings to develop candidate profile and recruitment brochure; (City considers utilizing community stakeholder survey to develop input on desired experience, attributes, and skills important for next city manager; Consultant to work with City - based on input - to prepare candidate profile for inclusion in recruitment brochure) - Consultant sends “draft” brochure to City for review - City returns draft brochure (with edits) to Consultant. - Consultant finalizes profile development and completes brochure preparation for approval and acceptance by City to share with prospective candidates – if City and Consultant proceed with Executive Search Implementation	July–Oct. 2022

PHASES II, III, IV & CONCLUSION: EXECUTIVE SEARCH IMPLEMENTATION

<u>Phase II</u> Advertising, Candidate outreach & recruitment	- Consultant commences executive recruitment advertising, marketing and candidate outreach. - Consultant to identify qualified candidates that meet the profile.	Dec. 5 – Jan. 25
<u>Phase III</u> Applicant screening, assessment, and recommendation of semi-finalists	- Consultant commences formal review of applications and sends most promising applicants a Candidate Questionnaire to provide additional information about background and experience. Candidates also complete recorded video interview online. - Consultant completes formal review of applications and sends selected resumes and questionnaire responses to the City for review, along with video interviews for review. - Consultant meets with City Council to recommend semi-finalists; City Council selects finalists for on-site interviews.	Jan. – Feb.
<u>Phase IV</u> Comprehensive background and reference checks completed for finalists On-site Interviews	- Consultant completes reference checks/background checks/ academic verification on finalists. <i>(Min. 10-15 working days required for background checks)</i> - Semi-finalists complete candidate leadership and management style behavioral assessment and responses are reviewed by Council. - Consultant sends Finalist Report to the City. - City conducts on-site interviews with finalists. Consultant to assist with interviews onsite.	Feb. – Mar.
<u>Conclusion</u> Offer made/accepted by candidate	City extends employment offer to selected candidate (Consultant will provide assistance in reviewing best practices, etc. if requested).	Mar. 24, 2023

City Manager Recruitment – Detailed Schedule

Proposed Timeline as of June 2, 2022

CITY MANAGER SEARCH - PHASE I

PROJECT TASK	DELIVERABLES	TARGET DATE
Kick-Off Discussions	Meetings with Mayor and Members of the City Council and other stakeholders to hear input for development of profile and recruitment brochure	Week of July 18 th
Draft Profile Review & Discussion by City Council	Consultant reviews draft brochure and profile with City Council; seeks clarification and any final input before developing final draft for Council review.	Monday, August 15
Final Review of Brochure and Advertisement	Consultant meets by digital video for final time as part of Phase I – development of ad, profile and marketing brochure for possible City Manager Search to begin in November/December	Monday, September 26

CITY MANAGER SEARCH – PHASES II, III, IV & CONCLUSION

Outreach Begins	BT launches recruitment by placing ads and contacting prospective candidates. Online applications are received	Mon., Dec. 5, 2022
First Review	Consultant begins First Review of applicants	Wed., Jan. 25, 2023
Applicant Review	Consultant screens applications, administer and review questionnaires	Jan. 26 – Feb. 8
Semi-Finalist Report	City receives Semi-Finalist Report and reviews candidate materials	Thurs., Feb. 9
Finalists Selected	Consultant meets with Council by Digital Video to consider candidates' application materials and to select finalists; design of interview candidates and process finalized by City	Mon., Feb. 20
Vetting of Candidates	Consultant completes reference, background and academic verification checks on finalists (Min. 10-15 business days)	Feb. 21 – Mar. 8
Finalist Report	City receives Finalist Report	Thurs., Mar. 9 (Finalist Report Delivered on Mar. 10)
Interviews	City conducts on-site interviews with finalists and selects top candidate	Week of March 13 or Week of March 20
Employment offer Made/Accepted	Consultant assists City in extending an employment offer to selected candidate	Fri., Mar. 24, 2023

Please Note: These are target dates that are subject to change based on the availability of City Officials, candidates, or other unforeseen circumstances that may arise during the process.

RFP #22037
Executive Recruitment Consulting Services –
City Manager for the City of Portland, Maine

CRITERIA	GovHR	Baker Tilly
Qualifications and Expertise ... (Assigned weight: 20)	18.7	19.0
Evaluation of Project Manager/Team ... (Assigned weight: 20)	18.7	19.0
Competitive Fee Proposal (Assigned weight: 20)	\$23,500.00 (20.0)	\$26,500.00 (17.7)
Completeness of Proposal ... (Assigned weight: 25)	23.0	23.3
Past Performance and References (Assigned weight: 15)	13.7	13.7
Completeness and Quality of Proposed Preparatory Phase (Assigned weight: 20)		
TOTAL		

Scorer's Initials: _____